

Merged feedback on the Habitat III policy unit paper frameworks

Policy paper framework 1: The Right to the City and Cities for All

Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
1.1, p.5	Urban form in relation to spatial strategies is (in this PU) not considering the effects or reality of informal settlement These are only considered in this PU in related to basic urban infrastructure and services (1.3)	Improvement of the rights to the city demands attention for the spatial effects of informal settlements' growth and their forced eviction and demolition.
3.4, p.4	Indicators disaggregated by geography are needed across dimensions not only under economy but also social and environmental ones	Indicators should disaggregated by geography (sub-city), age and gender

Policy paper framework 2: Socio-Cultural Urban Framework

General	Only one mention in document about informal settlements (p.8) in relation to informal economies	More attention is to be paid to the informal economy and informal settlements, not only as a challenge (p.8) but also for priority setting and action points with recognition of the fact that women are disproportionately represented in informal economies
b. p.6	In order to effectively inform policies of inclusion and to make meaningful comparisons within cities indicators should disaggregated by geography	Indicators should be disaggregated by geography (sub-city), age and gender

	(sub-city data). This comment is applicable to every policy unit.	
--	---	--

Policy paper framework 3: National Urban Policies

Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
In general	Little or no attention for the needed tripartite consultative approach for policy formation;	Chapter 3 (“Implementation...”): Organise per topic tripartite consultations (civil society, private sector, public sector) with well-selected key players taking into account women’s and youth voices

Policy paper framework 4: Urban Governance, Capacity and Institutional Development

Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
p.3 1.a. Multilevel governance	The identified challenge is “multi-level governance”. MLG is not so much of a challenge, but good implementation of MLG is. The text is a bit vague of what good MLG is	The suggestion is to start with a text like the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Effective multi-level governance aims at ensuring more efficient governance to enhance access to and quality of service delivery towards citizens. - Effective multi-level governance can only be achieved if a clear framework of division of powers and responsibilities between different spheres of government is in place, based on the principles of subsidiarity.
p.3. 1.a. Participation and Equity	A reference to the fact that there is also in many countries an increasingly low turn out in elections at all level: the legitimacy of governments is at stake and this needs to be reflected in the text	- There is a need to look at increasingly lower turnouts at elections at all levels in many countries. The New Urban Agenda needs to look at new ways of reaching out to citizens and look into new forms of governance to ensure that future generations feel sufficiently included in the decision making of local governments (and of other

		levels of government).
p.4. 1.a Capacity Building	Capacity building can be better defined: see suggestions in bold	- - Decentralisation policies have provided increased authority and resources to local governments, but there is still a gap between the responsibilities allocated to local governments and their capacities to implement their new responsibilities and their those to generate local revenue. This is also a huge challenge for their credibility towards citizens. - Increased capacity improves the functioning of local governments in executing their responsibilities. This can only be effective if capacity building focuses both on technical and political officials, for sufficient sustainability within the organization.
p.5. a.2 Disagreements / controversies Multi Level Governance	The first phrase is not clear	Suggestion to rephrase as follows: - There is debate on how to develop national urban or territorial policies that recognizes and harnesses the role of cities to tackle global challenges and promote national growth, while avoiding a top-down approach and ensuring ownership by local governments
p. 7 Capacity Building	"Weak civil society has led to a democratic deficit". In many places civil society requires more open, responsive institutions, rather than capacity building in order to be able to participate in local decision-making	
p. 10 2.b 1 List of key transformations Multi Level Governance	Not only involvement of local governments in metropolitan and subnational administrative reforms, but also in any kind of (sectoral) reform, legislation and policy that affects them directly.	Add between bullet 2 and 3: - Involvement of local government associations in all (foreseen) legislation and policies that affect them directly, through well-established consultation mechanisms in definition, implementation, monitoring and evaluation (and consequently financial arrangements to implement new powers and responsibilities deriving from these policies and legislation) Note: The lack of these consultations and dialogues is often due to the fact that the local government sector is rather weak, or because of reluctance to devolve power and resources. Support to capacity building of the associations of local governments is therefore crucial. The interest of local governments can thus be well represented at national level.
p. 11 Participation	Bullet 1: "including the use of local referenda":	Remove "including the use of local referenda regarding major urban

and Equity	local referenda are the solution for every country. I think we need to look at direct democracy mechanisms, but it depends on the context which mechanism you choose Bullet 4 is too subjective	transformations”. Remove “Current participation practices do not guarantee fairness and equity”.
p. 12 Capacity Building	Make more specific who needs to receive capacity building	- We need to allocate adequate resources for capacity building at local, national and international levels, of national, regional and local government politicians and staff to ensure they are able to implement their powers and responsibilities effectively.
p. 12 Capacity Building	Foster alliances between all actors	- We need to foster alliances between local governments, civil society, private sector and academia for learning between these actors.
p. 12 Capacity Building	Scale up through associations of local governments	- We need to scale up peer-to-peer learning and knowledge associations both within countries and also internationally through networks of cities. Local government associations are well placed to foster inter-municipal learning (exchange among members, training on a variety of topics and support decentralization processes)
p. 14 d. List of targets	Targets of multi level governance: Bullet 1: needs to specify that besides periodic elections they should be free Bullet 4 is not clear: develop national policies and mechanisms to ensure equal partnerships across governmental levels.	- Increase the number of countries with periodic, free and transparent elections of local and sub-national authorities - Establish consultation mechanisms across governmental levels (national, regional, local) for the joint definition, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of sustainable urban development and territorial cohesion.
3c1; p.20	Strange indicator of success regarding participation and equity	Remove: “The percentage of the urban population living in slums.”
General remark	Capacity building: in most of the cases the text does not mention to whom the capacity building initiatives need to be targeted. I wish to stress the importance of capacity building of both technical and political staff of local governments to manage urban areas effectively.	
p. 29 Annex 2	Additional ideas to strengthen the list of examples with some concrete cases	Multi-level governance: - include subsidiarity principles from European Union - include Code of Intergovernmental Relations from The

		<p>Netherlands</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - horizontal cooperation between cities: Smart Cooperation programme of the Association of Netherlands Municipalities <p>Participation and equity:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - G1000 initiatives; participation from all stakeholders to define priorities for the city and have groups of local stakeholders that are made responsible for follow up of the identified initiatives - Democratic Challenge; 99 innovative participatory ideas that have been gathered by the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Association of Netherlands Municipalities, with incubators to further these initiatives <p>Capacity Building:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Local Government Capacity Programme, to strengthen local governments worldwide, implemented by the Dutch Association of Municipalities, with expertise of Dutch local governments and supported by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (for example: support to creation of new town Rawabi in Palestinian Territories) - Urban development scenarios to ensure inclusion of host communities in Jordan and Lebanon, with expertise of Dutch urban planners of cities and in partnership with the Association of Netherlands Municipalities and the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs
--	--	---

general		Explain that capacity development goes beyond individual education and training, but also includes organisational development and institutional strengthening.
general		<p>Governance capacity building through creation of inter-city learning alliances</p> <p>Governance arrangements are to be made sector-specific (e.g. drinking water, food supply)</p>
p.10	At the CoP21 in Paris the high level delegation of Mayors were unanimous in their voice to	Metropolitan governance arrangements should be able to respond hazards, disasters and economic dynamics

	promote intercity cooperation. For climate change adaptation particularly but also for other innovations at city scale, urban governments can learn more from each other (internationally) than within a national framework.	
3a1; p.15	Key actions needed to allow for the previous	ADD: Training local officials to interact with community members in a participatory framework of equity, transparency and trust
3c1; p.20	Strange indicator of success regarding participation and equity	REMOVE: “The percentage of the urban population living in slums.”
Chapter 1, page 7	“Weak civil society has led to a democratic deficit.....” presumes a political climate of freedom for civil society – is that the case?	Freedom of association and freedom to negotiate are pre-conditions to allow civil society to play its complementary role as independent player that democratically represents their members’ interests with special attention to identification and feedback mechanisms for weaker voices in society (youth, women, vulnerable groups)
Chapter 2, page 12	Under capacity building: “We need to foster alliances.....for learning between these actors” – We would stress as first objective of alliances not the learning but the better achievement of concrete results	New text: ““We need to foster alliances between local government and civil society and private sector to work jointly on more effective solutions with learning effects
Capacity building, second bullet point, page 4	In our opinion it is a mutual cooperation. Not only to strengthen capacities but also to make use of the capacities of local stakeholders.	Suggestion to add (see words highlighted in <i>italic</i>): There is an urgent need for initiatives to strengthen capacities <i>and to embed the capacities, knowledge, and capabilities</i> of all local stakeholders (local government, civil society, business community) to improve urban governance and participatory <i>and co-production</i> processes.
Capacity building, fourth bullet point, page 7	In our opinion it is a mutual cooperation. Not only to strengthen capacities but also to make use of the capacities of local stakeholders.	Suggestion to add (see words highlighted in <i>italic</i>): Weak civil society has led to a democratic deficit. Capacity□building needs to focus on strengthening the voice and organisational capabilities of civil society. <i>Initiatives should embed the capacities, capabilities and knowledge of all local stakeholders, and in particular build on the already existing initiatives and knowledge of organized communities, and foster peer-learning.</i>
In general	Little or no attention being paid to the engagement of the private sector (companies, investors)	Include the private sector in the texts that regard cooperation between parties - in text for Challenges (ch.1), Priorities (ch.2) and Implementation (ch.3)

Policy paper framework 5: Municipal Finance and Local Fiscal Systems

Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
General	Insufficient attention for 'cost-effectiveness': the needed link between public expenditure and effects/ impact of the funded activities. This is closely related with accountability.	Include the concept of 'cost-effectiveness' and its related accountability in the chapters on Challenges (ch.1), Priorities (Ch.2) and Implementation (Ch.3)-

Policy paper framework 6: Urban Spatial Strategies: Land Market and Segregation

Include the name of the policy unit paper framework you focus your comments on	Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
Policy Paper 6, Urban Spatial Strategies	p.2, 1.a planning	Missing link between planning and the urban capacity.	Suggest to add: <i>Spatial planning could be instrumental to influence the urban capacity of our cities to design climate friendly / sustainable cities in the (near) future</i>
	p.3, 1.a Public space	Public-space led urban development is mentioned for the sake of public-space led urban development. Accessibility to green and public spaces is essential for the well-being of people, but can also be instrumental to address flood risk (e.g. floodable parks), provide cooling and reduce heat island effects. While on the other	Suggest to add: <i>Water is a key element in urban planning and design.</i> And Suggest to add: <i>Wordings on the benefits and co-benefits of accessible green and urban space (e.g. less loss and damage by extreme events and climate change, improved health of people with higher productivity and lower health care costs, more</i>

		hand, greening the city is only affordable when enough water is available.	<i>attractive investment climate for new entrepreneurship resulting in more jobs, acknowledging the value of ecosystem service for improved water quality, ecological corridors with positive effects on human well being.....)</i>
	p.3, 1.a.2 Disagreements / controversies	2 nd bullet: the application of planning approaches indeed has a wider context.	...incl. those contained in SDG 11.. [Suggest to add: <i>Such as water resources management; preventive measures to reduce the risks of flooding, coastal erosion, water shortness; disaster preparedness, among others.</i>
	p.3, 1.a.2 Disagreements / controversies	3 rd bullet: It is very good to call attention to wider phenomena like including the socio-economic scenarios as to improve forward looking planning into an uncertain future. Consequently, one may expect to read some guidance on how future scenarios may be influencing urban planning and development. It may refer to what has been described as striving to “the Just City”.. ?	It would be interesting to elaborate more on the spatial implication regarding these other phenomena and how to translate them from a strategy into a research question.
	p.4, 1.a.2 Disagreements / controversies, the population scenario	Here urbanising deltas are relevant to mention	Suggest to add: <i>In 2050, more than half of the world’s population [or, if preferred: 70% of the estimated 70% of the global population of 9 billion that will live in urban areas] will live in delta- and coastal cities</i>
	p.5, 1.a.2. Disagreements / controversies, the human settlements scenario.	Prevailing present approach: There is a link being mentioned to the governance aspects, however, a link to the physical context of cities is missing here.	Suggest to add wordings that address: <i>Also an analysis of the entire (urban) ecosystem on all scale levels should be included to prevent that urban sprawl will destroy both the rural areas and the way the city is enhancing itself (regarding infrastructure, water, food, energy consumption, etc) to become a climate-proof living area.</i>
	p.8, 2. Priorities inclusive and sustainable urbanization and capacity bullet 3: an insufficient	Missing link between governance – physical context of urban space.	Complexity theories are concerning the urban ecosystem as a whole. To develop inclusive and sustainable cities it is necessary to grasp this complexity. Not only from a decision making

	recognition of growing complexity,		point of view, also regarding the physical context of our cities.
	p.9, 2. Priorities inclusive and sustainable urbanization and capacity bullet 3: an insufficient sense of responsibility		Also the economic side of available resources should be taken into account for sustainable and inclusive urbanization
	p.9, 2. Priorities inclusive and sustainable urbanization and capacity Additional bullet point, in between (<i>promote..</i>) and (<i>establish</i>)..	Next to the framework and the monitoring there should be priority to analysing the current physical context to be able to monitor and plan it.	Suggest to add: <i>Realise regular "system analysis" or audits of the urban ecosystem to understand the physical context, its needs, and its urban resources</i>
	p.10, 2. Priorities access to safe, inclusive and accessible green and public spaces	Could these green/public areas also contribute to the lower income residents in an economic way? For example food production based on local ecological conditions could provide users with food / maintenance for this food (= jobs)	The discrimination between consolidated, expansion and shrinking urban areas, respectively, is very useful. Suggest to add: <i>[for all three categories, finding the right <blend of> financing instruments is a challenge in itself].</i>
	p.11, 2. Priorities access to safe, inclusive and accessible green and public spaces	Bullet 5: compactness of cities has a limit, ref. remarks earlier/elsewhere Bullet 6 & 7: see above: good to mention some arguments that promote more innovative approaches, a.o. green-blue dream	...compact citiesto enhance the provision of ecosystem services. Suggest to add: <i>[acknowledging the important role of water, which may need "space" for it's own sake in times of flooding or surplus of rainwater].</i> And ...implementation and maintenance of green and public spaces. Suggest to add: <i>[...Green spaces are also essential to address some of the water management issues].</i>
	p.13, 3.a.1. Key recommendations for action	Bullet 2: good to notice the proposed Intergov. Panel on Sustainable Urbanisation, with a mandate clearly in the field of <u>knowledge</u> exchange and development.	
	p.14, 3.a.1. implementation supporting positive e/s/env	Monitoring is not included, while it is important for developing	Suggest to add: <i>Develop guidelines and a set of criteria</i>

	links.....	guidelines	<i>regarding green and public spaces planning and how to evaluate/ monitor them.</i>
	p.14, 3.a.1. implementation access to safe, inclusive and accessible green and public spaces	Bullet 5 – see remark made earlier, green and public space is also meant for water (storage etc.)level public space. Suggest to add: <i>[, taking into account the important role of water.]</i>
	p.15, 3.a.1 implementation access to safe, inclusive and accessible green and public spaces	Under bullet 4: “technical criteria....permeable pavements, collections ponds, coastal buffers, floodable parks.....	These aspects related to water are only found here, at the end of the doc. They are too much hidden. Suggest to bring them more upfront in the text.
	p.15, 3.a.1 implementation spatial planning and land	2 nd alinea: “Good practices of urban acupuncture, incl. guerrilla/alternative/radical urbanism, should be taken up. These issues are also to be mentioned more upfront, as these wordings provide an incentive to look for creative approaches.	Please note not all developments in the city are to be regulated. There should be some “free space” left, left for typical issues related to the social identity of the city, room for ‘backside’ aspects
	p.16, 3.a.1. conclusion	Urban capacity could be included to broaden the scope of this paper regarding policy statements	Create national urban strategies that recognize the role of cities as engines of the economy and call for balanced territorial development by attending to national infrastructure investments that support the economic prosperity, environmental protection, reduce urban capacity and social justice for all.
	p.16, 3.a.1. conclusion		...existing development, upgrade slums and Suggest to add: <i>[gentrification to be avoided]</i>
	p.16, 3.a.1. conclusion	...policies adapted at Habitat III...	Is meant: “adopted” ?

Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
p.11	The document does not include any reference to the impact of private urban spaces such as gated communities on spatial	Pay attention to the fact that in many countries the vicinity to high quality green and public spaces has a direct impact on land and real estate values; this may have a positive impact on municipal income, e.g. through land taxation and the granting of development

	<p>segregation, mobility, high consumption of land and availability of public space.</p> <p>(see: UN-HABITAT (2007) STATE OF THE WORLD'S CITIES REPORT 2006/7 pp. 146-147)</p> <p>THIS ARGUMENT IS ALSO CONCERNING PU-10</p>	<p>rights; however, it may also lead to inequality and segregation. [ADD] Pay also attention to the impact of gated communities on spatial segregation, mobility, high consumption of land and availability of public space.</p>
P13, a1	<p>Informal settlement dwellers and slum dwellers are several times referred to as group to involve in the benefits of better planning and public space. They should be mentioned in this paragraph, in addition to other players; No mentioning of the role of the civil society players here.</p>	<p>Add a dot: incorporate civil society and local inhabitants for local knowledge and clarify local demands / participatory planning etc..</p>

Policy paper framework 7: Urban Economic Development Strategies

Par. & page	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
1.3, p3& 10 2.7: p16 3.2: p19 3.3	<p>A fourth challenge is that urban economies are strongly influenced by the international economy. This is only mentioned on page 17 (implementation). Page 10 overstates the importance of local governments in local economic development.</p>	<p>Section 1.3. Add that cities can't be expected to solve employment issues in isolation, due to the (inter)nationalisation of economies. Some comments on page 10 may need a more careful formulation. Page 16: (inter)national networks of cities and other actors are not addressed, but are a core part of economic governance! Page 19/20: add city networks</p>
1.5, p7	<p>Cities compete in different sectors, demanding different locational factors.</p>	<p>Apart from the already two mentioned competitiveness factors of infrastructure and cost-adjusted labor skills a third factor is the presence of tacit knowledge networks.</p>

1.6, p7 2.7, p16 3.2, p19 3.3	The sections are government centred. Private and civil stakeholders are hardly mentioned, but also need competences and a voice in order to participate	Page 7; add private stakeholders Page 8: add private and civil sector capacity Page 16: capacity, expertise and a VOICE of private, civic and intermediary actors (such as chambers of commerce) is also needed Page 19/20: add competence building of intermediate actors
General	Text looks incomplete, e.g. at various places the word “FACTS” is included to indicate needed evidence to be added, (1.1 – page3, 1.4 – page6); 1.2 reference to an Annex on diversity of cities that doesn’t exist; phrases not clearly formulated and formulations “kort door de bocht”	
General	Little or no attention for food supply to cities	Include urban food supply and related rural – urban economic interplay
General (e.g. 1.3 (p. 3,4, 5) and 2.1 (p.12)	Little attention for the needed link to be constructed in many countries between the informal economy (livelihood of most people) and the formal economy (Some short formulations on the relevance and the feasibility of links to be made between informal economy and formal economy

Policy paper framework 8: Urban Ecology and Resilience

Include the name of the policy unit paper framework you focus your comments on	Number of remark/ suggestion	Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
One general remark to start with			In many of our suggestions, you will see a reference to urban water and water-related disasters. We noted that this could come back more explicit in the draft paper, as it is so crucially linked to both urban ecology and	We have tried to incorporate the relevance of water in our suggestions and would appreciate a reference to the described line of thinking

			<p>urban resilience.</p> <p>The 2015 World Economic Forum (WEF) report indicated the impact of water crises (concerning fresh water availability, access to clean drinking water, water quality incl pollution, scarcity, drought, floods).</p> <p>Especially in urban areas – with many people living together and a high concentration of economic activity -, the dependence (fresh water, drinking water) and the impact on (pollution) and of (flooding, droughts) water is immense.</p>	<p>somewhere more explicitly in the paper.</p>
8 – Urban Ecology and Resilience	1	p. 2, para 1	<p>Urbanizing Delta's are facing the described fragility in more extremety, due to a combination of social-economic dynamics (most economic assets concentrate in Delta's, as does the population growth) and natural/environmental dynamics (such as flood risks due to their location at the interface of sea and rivers). They also have a large amount of ecosystems. We suggest to include a reference to this relevance in the introduction and have suggested a wording to reflect this.</p>	<p>Suggest to add:</p> <p><i>In 2050, almost half of the world's population will live in delta- and coastal cities, due to their excellent conditions for economic activity and human settlement at the interface of water and land. However, that concentration of assets and humans also makes them especially vulnerable to the fragility of ecosystems and the risk disasters, such as flooding from sea and/or rivers.</i></p>
	2	p.4, Vision, para ii-viii	<p>The paper may, in it's vision, reflect better the city as being an entity not in isolation, acting on dynamic pathways into a partly uncertain future, capable of looking ahead continuously and thus fostering adaptive policies and adequate preventive actionable agenda's.</p> <p>Water should be more explicitly mentioned as a key element in linking various of the interrelated issues at hand.</p> <p>Furthermore, cities may interact more with each other, as to accelerate learning and improving performances through city to city learning.</p>	<p>ii. Please add catchment area: "Neighbourhood, district, city, region", [suggest to add: (where relevant) <i>catchment area</i>]</p> <p>iii. The city will maximise ...<i>as they are naturally connected with their hinterlands</i></p> <p>vii - ...capable of responding to shocks and stresses. <i>Through pro-active, preventive measures the city will reduce the risks of extreme events</i></p>

			<p>Many cities are located at either a river, sea or lake (and very often at the interface: delta-cities). Water links cities with its hinterland (for trade, but also for drinking water, water quality, etc.) as well as with different sectors, like energy, food, ecosystems. Integrated management of water provides a firm basis for urban development. At the same time, it should be noted that a city cannot be resilient without a resilient catchment area: water does not respect the city boundaries. This is why we suggest to add the catchment area to the scale of the future cities.</p>	viii - ...reduction of environmental impact <i>of human activities</i>
	3	p. 5, para i	We suggest to include the specific SDG numbers that are referred to in the last sentence	“and include related and inter-related goals on ... water management, and resilient infrastructure” [suggest to add: i.e. SDG # # #)
	4	p. 5, para v	Does the issue paper not include any reference to the prevention of disasters from happening? I.e. building soft and hard infrastructure aimed at preventing a flood and at mitigating the impact of the flood (or any other disaster).	
		p 6-8, 1.b.1-7,	The wordings used to describe the various challenges is rather negative. They could be framed in a more positive fashion, as to inspire and invite to address opportunities.	Rewrite all, e.g. 1.b.1.i: Improve and foster coherence and cross-sectoral coordination and collaboration etc etc
	5	p. 6, 1.b.1 Governance, para i	Water is a sector that connects to all the sectors that are mentioned and it is a crucial one in cities (water quality related to sanitation and human / economic activity; drinking water availability; recreational aspects and liveability; trade/shipping; food-energy-water nexus), we therefore suggest to add it to the examples	“e.g. health, environment, energy, transport and housing” [suggest to add: <i>and water</i>]
	6	p. 6, 1.b.1 Governance,	The lack of financial discipline is often	“Lack of financial discipline”

		para viii	<p>related to lack of a long-term vision aimed on sustainable urban development and enhancement of resilience, including investments in preventive actions.</p> <p>Regarding the latter: investment in prevention of disasters is often proven to be a very sensible action as it decreases the number of livelihoods at stake and protects the economic assets of the city. However, due to lack of discipline and long-term vision, financial resources are not always invested as such. We would very much appreciate a reference to this, but think it fits better in 1.b.2 and will make a suggestion (see remark 7)</p>	<p>[suggest to add: <i>and long-term and large scale planning that can be combined with small scale projects, that can be implemented on the short term</i>]</p> <p>NB this suggestion might also fit well / better on p. 7, 1.b.4. Planning</p>
	7	p. 6, 1.b.2 Policy	<p>As described above, investing in prevention by building resistance and resilience to natural disasters is a costly investment but one that does pay off in the future (in terms of lives saved and economic assets protected). For example, in the case of investment in the prevention of flooding:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A proper flood risk management will prevent flooding, which means that the costs for compensation of the damage, cleaning and reconstruction of damage areas will be avoided. These costs will be much higher than the investments for a proper flood risk management. - A proper flood risk management will make a city more attractive and lead to higher investments of private companies, resulting in higher revenues of public taxes. The CPB Netherlands Bureau for Economic Policy Analysis calculated that the annual benefits of the Dutch Delta Works are 4 x more than the annual costs (annual write-off of investments and annual maintenance). 	<p>Suggest to add: <i>ix. Foster and further policies aimed at preventing (water-related) disasters from happening instead of a reactive approach to them.</i></p>

			<p>UNISDR refers to a 7-fold return on investments.</p> <p>- Too often, the reaction is still reactive response to disaster instead of a proactive approach aimed at <u>prevention</u>, both in terms of policy and in finance attached to it. We think this is very relevant for cities as they contain the biggest concentration of assets & humans and, often due to their location at sea/river/lake, are most vulnerable to natural – and very often water-related – disasters. Therefore we strongly support a suggestion in line with above.</p>	
	8	p. 7, 1.b.3 Capacity, para iv and / or v	<p>Suggest to include awareness on the risk of disasters and what to do in case a disaster does happen. (this was also one of the suggestions of the OECD for improvement of our NL water governance. As is written in your paper, resilience is achieved through a combination of hard and soft infrastructure; and awareness of the population is very important)</p> <p>NB: it is already mentioned in 1.b.7 – iii, but we think it also is relevant here</p>	<p>“Limited knowledge of urban ... in urban management”</p> <p>[suggest to add: <i>as well as limited awareness on the risk of a disaster and the own responsibilities and actions to take in case a disaster does happen</i>]</p>
	9	p. 7, 1.b.4 Planning, para ii	<p>Local food security is very much dependant on the availability of fresh-water resources of sufficient quality. This requires integrated water management – very often at regional and sometimes even at transboundary level.</p>	<p>“Land conversion and land degradation patterns that reduce resilience and threaten local food security”</p> <p>[suggest to add: <i>exacerbated by insufficient integrated water management</i>]</p>
	10	p. 7, 1.b.4 Planning, para iii	<p>Again, water is a sector that connects to all the sectors that are mentioned and it is a crucial one in cities (water quality related to sanitation and human / economic activity; drinking water availability; recreational aspects and liveability; trade/shipping; food-energy-water nexus; prevention of water-related disasters), we therefore suggest to add it to the examples.</p>	<p>“Need for systemic AND ADAPTIVE planning...integrates housing, transport, WATER, energy and green systems”</p> <p>[suggest to add: <i>and adaptive</i> respectively <i>and water</i>]</p>

			Furthermore, planning is not a one step endeavor, rather a continuous iterative and cyclic process, allowing for adapting to new insights and circumstances.	
	11	p. 7, 1.b.4 Planning	NB: this suggestion was also made in remark 6.	suggest to add: <i>viii. long-term and large scale planning that can be combined with small scale projects, that can be implemented on the short term</i>
	12	p. 7, 1.b.4. Planning	<p>The relevance of a preventive approach to (water-related) disasters instead of (only) a reactive response when a disaster occurs has been described in remark 7. We believe that planning plays a crucial role in achieving a more resilient city as well as a protected urban environment.</p> <p>Example: Being prepared to moderate floods means spatial adaptation by special facilities in the built environment (buildings as well as public space), to limit the consequences of flooding as much as possible. Especially vital functions in the urban fabric such as facilities for energy supply, health care and public and private transport should be safeguarded from flooding.</p> <p>Furthermore, when a disaster does happen, it helps if the planning has included contingency plans and evacuation routes, reachable evacuation sites and trained first-aid and emergency teams.</p>	Suggest to add: <i>ix. Need for preventive planning and design aimed at anticipation of expected or possible effects of climate change to reduce loss and damages (e.g safeguarding the location of vital infrastructure like hospitals and evacuation routes)</i>
	13	p. 8, 1.b.6. Environment, para i	Adaptation to climate change is very important, as cities are already experiencing the impacts today. We think this should be mentioned, as the debate on climate is very often on mitigation and less so on adaptation. Adaptation to climate change means very often adaptation to (the risk of)	“Increased shocks and stresses requiring adaptation” [suggest to add: <i>including to water-related disasters, especially in face of climate change</i>]

			water-related disasters, since the majority of climate change is channeled through water (sea and river level rise, salinization, droughts, extreme weather events like heavy rainfall). This cannot be omitted in a text on climate change, which is why we made this suggestion.	
	14	p. 8, 1.b.6. Environment para i	Para i is mentioned twice. Mitigation carries significant costs, but adaptation too. This could be referred here or in combination with remark 13.	
	15	p. 8, 1.b.6. Environment para ii	Pollution of rivers and streams does impact green space but also the human health through the quality of drinking water	"... with impacts on green space" [suggest to add: <i>and public health through the quality of drinking water</i>]
	16	p.8, 1.b.6. Environment	Many cities use groundwater for the provision of drinking water to their citizens. However, as a result cities located in areas with soft sub-soils, like in river/coastal/delta areas, face the issue of compacting soils, subsidence. Subsidence often occurs at a higher rate compared to sea level rise	[suggest to add: vii: <i>Improve water resources management to reduce subsidence by reducing inadequate ground water extraction</i>
	17	p. 8, 1.b.7. Culture, Livelihoods and consumption patterns	The consequences of (water-related) disasters especially affect the poorest and vulnerable population, as they are often the once that are living in vulnerable areas that were not urbanized previously – because they are the most vulnerable areas of the deltas. Next to the danger to be drowned, floods result in mass health and famine problems, hitting especially the urban poor.	Suggest to add: <i>The poorest and most marginalized populations are also the most vulnerable ones to (water-related) disasters, due to the often vulnerable location of their house and the unstable construction of it (both very dangerous in case of extreme rains or flooding), the high concentration of people at one place and the lack of access to basic amenities such as clean drinking water and sanitation, thereby affecting health.</i> Suggest to add "communication":

				<i>ix: Improve communication with stakeholders and public, as to increase awareness and commitment on actionable agendas</i>
	18	p. 8, c.1 List of examples/projects	We are more than happy to provide you with a case on Delta-cities or Urbanising Deltas, either Dutch or an example in another country where we work together with the central/local governments. It may address best practices in integrated planning, preventive action ref. flooding, subsidence, water scarcity, Room for the River and other spatial planning concepts	To be decided, do feel free to contact us when needed!
	19	p. 9, d.1. SDG Goals and targets	In line with remark 3, we would like to suggest to include specifically the SDG numbers of the SDGs that are referred to in this text.	“and include related an inter-related goals on ... water management, and resilient infrastructure” [suggest to add: <i>i.e. SDG # # #</i>)]
	20	p. 9 d.2 List of other indicators to be taken into account	Data should be gathered as much as possibly by using common international standards to ensure it is compatible between the various States. It should, as much as possible, be publically available, to support policy-making, research and economic development. The text already refers to joint fact finding which we highly support. We suggest to make this paragraph more concrete, at least the SDGs and Sendai framework should be mentioned. (The Sendai framework recognizes that the State has the primary role to reduce disaster risk but that responsibility should be shared with other stakeholders including local government, the private sector and other stakeholders. It aims for the following outcome: “ <i>The substantial reduction of disaster risk</i> ”	Suggest to add: <i>Data should be gathered as much as possibly by using common international standards to ensure it is compatible between the various States. It should, as much as possible, be publically available, to support policy-making, research and economic development. Joint fact finding is key, to allow for feedback and iteration.</i> <i>The development of monitoring and implementation of the SDGs should be closely taken into account, as well as those that are developed in light of the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015-2030</i>

			<p><i>and losses in lives, livelihoods and health and in the economic, physical, social, cultural and environmental assets of persons, businesses, communities and countries.”</i></p> <p>It is therefore very relevant for the challenges in cities.)</p>	
	21	p. 10, 2.b.1 Governance	In line with remark 6-7 (and 11)	Suggest to add: <i>v. Need for a long-term vision combined with small scale projects, that can be implemented on the short term, including the safeguarding of financial funds to implement that vision in the future. A vision that includes climate changes and the prevention to the impacts thereof.</i>
	22	p. 10, 2.b.1 Governance, para ii	In line with remark 2	“... and local government levels” [suggest to add: <i>as well as on the catchment area]</i>
	23	p. 10, 2.b.1 Governance	In line with earlier remarks on the interlinking role of water.	Suggest to add: <i>v: Water to be addressed as a cross-sectoral key element in urban development and planning</i>
	24	p. 10, 2.b.2 Policy, para ii	In line with remark 13 and remark 7	“... already been damaged” [suggest to add: <i>Since adaptation to climate change means very often adaptation to (the risk of) water-related disasters – the majority of climate change is channeled through water (sea and river level rise, salinization, droughts, extreme weather events like heavy rainfall) –, governments and policymakers should aim at a preventive approach instead of a reactive response to (water-related) disasters. Prevention pays off in terms of lives saved</i>

				<i>and assets protected, no costs for restoration of damage areas, etc.]</i>
	25	p. 11, 2.b.2 Policy, para iv	Mitigation of risks is the same as preventive action?	Suggest to add wording on “prevention”
	26	p. 12, 2.b.4 Planning	Building with nature and green-blue infrastructures can help cities to adapt to climate change continuously, by using the formative power of nature. It also adds to the liveability of a city. We suggested an extra para on this important concept.	<p>Suggest to add: <i>xii. Building with nature can help cities to adapt to climate change continuously, by using the formative power of nature.</i></p> <p><i>Furthermore, important elements of land-use planning in urbanizing deltas are ‘green-blue infrastructures’: spatial frameworks for combinations of long term water- and nature sensitive urban environments with short term economic and social initiatives. Open spaces in urban areas, wet and dry and vegetated, provide an alternative way to design synergies among nature, infrastructure and users. They provide a new balance among the maintenance, storage and discharge of storm water, resulting in a stabilization of groundwater levels and stopping the process of land subsidence. Moreover, these infrastructures have proved to play a role in urban revitalization, economic development and community building by citizens.</i></p>
	27	p. 12, 2.b.4 Planning, iv	In line with remark 2	“address urban-rural linkages...” [suggest to add: <i>incl in the river basin</i>]
	28	p. 12, 2.b.4 Planning	In line with remark 12 and other remarks on	Suggest to add:

			water and prevention, respectively.	<p><i>xiii Planned urban development is also a means to increase resiliency of cities against natural and man-made disasters. Planning should be aimed at anticipation of expected or possible effects of climate change, i.e. by safeguarding the location of vital infrastructure like hospitals and evacuation routes and by putting hard infrastructure in place for prevention.</i></p> <p>And</p> <p><i>xiii: Consider water as a key issue to be addressed by all sectors, which is in favour of integrated approaches ref. nexus water-food-energy-health</i></p>
	29	p. 12, 2.b.5. Infrastructure, para i	In line with a.o. remark 7 “Water services” relate to water supply, but also to storage, drainage and protection against flooding	<p>“... and climate resilience.”</p> <p>[Suggest to add: <i>And that are aimed at a preventing (water-related) disasters from happening, combined with an emergency response and mitigation of potential impact”.</i></p>
	30	p. 13 2.b.7. Environment	In line with remark 26	Suggest to add a reference to <i>green infra & building with nature to reach resilience and increase livability of the city</i>
	31	p. 13 2.b.7. Environment, para ii	The word <i>co-benefits</i> may need an example to relate it to preventive action. Also, cross-sectoral approaches should be furthered, for which one might refer to the nexus concept of thinking (e.g. water-food-energy and health).	<p>ii: ...co-benefits for resilience,</p> <p>[suggest to add: <i>such as temporal water storage to prevent flooding</i>]</p> <p>Suggest to add wordings on <i>integrated approaches ref. nexus water-food-energy-health</i></p>
	32	p. 13 2.b.7. Environment	In line with remark 8	Suggest to add: <i>v. Increase awareness on the risk of a disaster and the own</i>

				<i>responsibilities and actions to taken in case a disaster does happen</i>
	33	p. 15 3.a.1. Create an enabling framework, para v	Cities are not at their own... they may be linked by water, they may be linked by national governance, but they may also learn from cities in other countries. Especially medium sized cities need more support urgently than is available now in existing networks.	Suggest to add: <i>vi. Create an environment, both nationally and internationally, for city to city learning, sharing lessons learned and to accelerate scaling up of promising interventions</i>
	34	p. 16 3.a.2. Planning and designing interventions		Suggest to add a bullet: <i>o: Use planning and design as tool to increase resilience to natural and man-made disasters, by investing into hard, preventive infrastructure; creating multifunctional and open spaces; locating vital infrastructure and escape routes in a sensible, resilient manner; providing guidelines for this; etc.</i>

Policy paper framework 9: Urban Services and Technology

Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
General	There is no reference to ICT in this chapter yet it is a crucial element of many infrastructures – the smart city discussion is related and is dealt with under urban housing and basic services. A connection to this chapter would be wise.	Reference to be made to ICT's important role for Smart City development
Last bullet point, last sentence Page 4	According to me the waste industry is missing in this sentence	Suggestion to add: waste: between the water, <i>waste</i> , energy and food industries,
Bullet point Water and Sanitation, Page 13	Reference to the Rio+20 outcome document and to good examples from GWOPA: Global Water Operator's Partnerships Alliance	Suggestion to add: Water and Sanitation - Significantly reduce water pollution, increase water quality and significantly improve wastewater treatment - Improve water efficiency and reduce water losses. - Increase the capacity building pool of public and private utilities

Policy paper framework 10: Housing Policies

Include paragraph number & page number	Include explanation/your motivation behind your inputs	Formulate your comments by including a proposal for a text/key words or revised wording
		pay more attention to the national level within the institutional structure for housing policies

